NEWFOUNDLAND AND LABRADOR BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF PUBLIC UTILITIES

AN ORDER OF THE BOARD

NO. A.I. 6(2021)

- **IN THE MATTER OF** the *Automobile* 1
- 2 Insurance Act, RSNL 1990, c. A-22,
- 3 as amended, and regulations
- thereunder: and 4
- 5
- 6 **IN THE MATTER OF** an application
- 7 by Facility Association for approval to
- 8 implement a revised rating program for
- 9 its Public Vehicles category of
- 10 automobile insurance.
- 11 12
- WHEREAS on November 27, 2020 Facility Association applied to the Board for approval of a
- 13 14 revised rating program under the Mandatory filing option for its Public Vehicles category of automobile insurance; and 15 16
- 17 WHEREAS the filing proposed changes to the following classes of Public Vehicles: (a) Public 18 Bus, (b) Private Bus, (c) School Bus, (d) Hotel & Country Club Bus, (e) Funeral, (f) Ambulance, 19 and (g) Taxi; and
- 20
- 21 WHEREAS Facility Association subsequently withdrew its Taxi proposal; and 22
- 23 WHEREAS Facility Association filed the following overall rate level indications and proposed 24 changes:

| Vehicle Class | Overall Rate Level Indication | Overall Rate Level Proposal |
|--------------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Public Bus | +4.8% | +4.8% |
| Private Bus | -0.7% | -0.7% |
| School Bus | +10.9% | +10.9% |
| Hotel & Country Club Bus | +4.2% | +4.2% |
| Funeral | +5.0% | +5.0% |
| Ambulance | +3.1% | +3.1% |

- 25 WHEREAS on January 29, 2021 the Board's actuarial consultants, Oliver Wyman Limited
- ("Oliver Wyman"), filed a report of findings with the Board; and 26

- WHEREAS Oliver Wyman identified concerns with Facility Association's assumptions for loss 1 2 trend rates, complement of credibility and return on investment income; and
- 3

4 **WHEREAS** Oliver Wyman reported that substituting alternative assumptions for loss trend rates,

5 complement of credibility and return on investment income would reduce Facility Association's

overall rate level indications as follows: 6

| Vehicle Class | Facility Association Overall Rate Level Indication | Oliver Wyman Alternative Rate Level Indications |
|--------------------------|--|---|
| Public Bus | +4.8% | -3.2% to -1.0% |
| Private Bus | -0.7% | -5.2% to -4.2% |
| School Bus | +10.9% | -1.7% to -1.6% |
| Hotel & Country Club Bus | +4.2% | -2.6% to -1.9% |
| Funeral | +5.0% | -0.6% to +0.4% |
| Ambulance | +3.1% | -3.5% to -1.7% |

7 WHEREAS, in response to the Oliver Wyman findings, Facility Association noted that there will

8 always be differences in actuarial views with respect to the appropriate rate level and that it

- 9 continues to believe its assumptions are justified, supported and reasonable; and
- 10

11 **WHEREAS** the Board acknowledges that there are a wide range of possible outcomes in any prospective ratemaking exercise and that the variance in the overall rate level indications produced 12 13 by Facility Association and Oliver Wyman was the result of differing actuarial judgements on a 14 number of the assumptions included in the rate analysis; and

15

16 WHEREAS the Board notes that there was considerable uncertainty in the calculation of the rate level indications in this analysis due to the limited available data for Public Vehicles: and 17

18

19 WHEREAS the Board is satisfied that the proposed rates are just and reasonable in the 20 circumstances, do not impair the solvency of the insurer, are not excessive in relation to the 21 financial circumstances of the insurer, and do not violate the Automobile Insurance Act or the 22 Insurance Companies Act or the respective regulations thereunder.

23 24

25 **IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED THAT:** 26

- 27 1. The revised rating program received on November 27, 2020 from Facility Association for its 28 Public Vehicles category of automobile insurance (Public Bus, Private Bus, School Bus, Hotel 29 & Country Club Bus, Funeral and Ambulance) is approved to be effective no sooner than July
- 1, 2021 for new business and renewals. 30

DATED at St. John's, Newfoundland and Labrador, this 11th day of March, 2021.

allhalen

Darlene Whalen, P. Eng., FEC Chair and Chief Executive Officer

John O'Brien, FCPA, FCA, CISA Commissioner

ndo

Cheryl Blundon Board Secretary